*Georgia Educational Researcher*

Article Review Form

I. Writing Style

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| Grammar |  |  |  | \* |
| Readability |  |  |  | \* |
| Word Use |  |  |  | \* |
| Punctuation |  | \* |  |  |

Overall Writing Style

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
| \* | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
|  | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| In the abstract, it is good to provide the implication of this research for the researchers in the field. |

II. APA Issues

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| References |  |  |  | \* |
| Citations |  | \* |  |  |
| Tables |  | \* |  |  |
| Figures |  | \* |  |  |

Overall APA

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
| \* | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
|  | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| Please do not cite an article throughout a paragraph if it is the only study to which you refer in the paragraph.  Please check the APA format for title of Figure 1. Also, the researchers mentioned four pillars but the figure 1 shows the pyramid. Please make them clear.  In Table 1, when reporting percentage, you should report the numbers together. Ex) n (%). BTW, where did you get the percentages? Please provide the source. |

III. Introduction

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| Appropriate Title |  |  |  | \* |
| Clear & Readable |  |  |  | \* |
| Interesting |  |  |  | \* |
| Appropriate & Complete |  | \* |  |  |

Overall Introduction

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
| \* | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
|  | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| The introduction is clear and well written. However, researchers are encouraged to address the significance of the study why this research is important and worthwhile to examine with for others in the field. What will be the beneficial in the broader educational field? |

IV: Theoretical Framework and/or Literature Review (if applicable)

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| Thoroughness |  | \* |  |  |
| Appropriateness |  | \* |  |  |
| Organization |  | \* |  |  |
| Focus |  |  |  |  |

Overall Theoretical Framework and/or Literature Review

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
| \* | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
|  | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| Please do not cite an article throughout a paragraph if it is the only study to which you refer in the paragraph. Also, I found many direct quotes. Rather than direct quotes, please do paraphrase. Also, many paragraphs rely on one article in the literature review. The literature review should be synthesizing and analyzing several relevant articles to support the current research or find the gap among existing studies. |

V: Methods (if applicable)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Not Applicable | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| Participants |  |  |  |  | \* |
| Instrument(s) |  |  |  |  | \* |
| Procedures |  |  | \* |  |  |
| Design |  |  |  | \* |  |
| Data Collection |  |  |  |  | \* |
| Data Analysis |  |  |  |  | \* |

Overall Methods

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
|  | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
| \* | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| Researchers mentioned briefly that the survey was designed by themselves. Please provide how and with what procedures the survey items were created. Also, how many items were provided and are they open-ended questions or yes/no?  Page 12, The title of the table 1 should include “cubes” and “five bags.” Otherwise, it seems irrelevant. |

VI: Report of Findings

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| Clear indication of findings |  |  |  | \* |
| Display of supporting evidence |  |  |  | \* |
| Logic  of sequence |  |  |  | \* |
| Thoroughness of findings |  |  |  | \* |

Overall Report of Findings

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
|  | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
| \* | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| Page 15, where is the result of survey before teaching demonstration? |

VII: Conclusion

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
| Research questions answered |  |  |  |  |
| Current literature incorporated |  |  |  |  |
| Implications of the findings |  |  |  |  |
| Concluding statement |  |  |  |  |
| Recommendations included |  |  |  |  |

Overall Conclusion

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
|  | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
| \* | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

VIII: Miscellaneous Issues – Type in as needed

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Needs Substantial Improvement | Slight Modifications Needed | Acceptable  As Is | Outstanding  As Is |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Overall Miscellaneous Issues

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  | Needs to be significantly improved and submitted for further review. |
|  | Needs to be revised slightly.  If reviewer’s comments are dealt with adequately, further review is not necessary. |
| \* | No revision necessary.  Writing is ready for publication. |

Comments:

|  |
| --- |
| I recommend this manuscript for publication with slight revisions. |