July 3, 2020

Re: Resubmission of manuscript “Interpersonal Dynamics of the Supervisory Triad of Pre-Service Teacher Education: Lessons Learned from 15 Years of Research,” MS #1179

Dear Editors:

Thank you for your acceptance of my article, “Interpersonal Dynamics of the Supervisory Triad of Pre-Service Teacher Education: Lessons Learned from 15 Years of Research,” for publication in the upcoming edition of *Georgia Educational Researcher*.

Although there were no specific edits requested by the reviewers of my article, I felt the need to make small revisions throughout the paper, all of which are detailed on the following pages. I believe these changes have strengthened the originality and overall quality of the article.

Thank you for your consideration of these edits. I appreciate the opportunity to publish my research in *Georgia Educational Researcher*.

Thank you,

Anna Hart, EdD

Columbus State University

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Original** | **Revised** |
| Carbaugh (1999) discusses positioning in the context that it is a “transitory interactional accomplishment that creatively implicates, (re)produces and possibly develops cultural meaning systems (which are themselves cross-culturally variable)” (p. 176). Tan and Moghaddam (1995) go so far as to say that “a satisfying discussion of positioning (on any level) absolutely *requires* the inclusion of cultural considerations” (p. 388, emphasis in original). | Carbaugh (1999) identified positioning as a means for reinforcing, furthering, and potentially assisting in the creation of “cultural meaning systems” (p. 176) that are themselves often variable both within and across cultures. Tan and Moghaddam (1995) go so far as to say that a discussion of positioning in any capacity is incomplete and therefore ineffective if culture is not included as a point of consideration. |
| All members of the triad position themselves as well as the remaining members of the triad, and that positioning has an influence on the TCs clinical experience. | All members of the triad position themselves as well as the remaining members of the triad, and that positioning has an influence on the teacher candidate’s clinical experience. |
| Yee (1968) asserted decades ago that a pre-service teacher’s clinical experience is an opportunity to “perform, evaluate, act, react, and adapt in relationship with and in response to others involved in the [supervisory] setting” (p. 97). | Yee (1968) asserted decades ago that a pre-service teacher’s clinical experience is an opportunity to “perform, evaluate, act, react, and adapt in relationship with and in response to others involved in the [supervisory] setting” (p. 97), a basic description of the clinical experience that holds true today. |
| The meta-synthesis methodology developed as an outgrowth of the seminal qualitative synthesis methodology, meta-ethnography, and was conceived as a response to a parallel quantitative methodology, meta-analysis (e.g. Glass, 1976). ~~Meta-synthesis differs from meta-ethnography in that “meta-ethnography is a form of metastudy that entails the interpretive comparison of study findings, not the integration of them” (Sandelowski & Barroso, 2007, p. 21).~~ Specifically, meta-synthesis is defined as “a form of systematic review or integration of qualitative research findings in a target domain that are themselves interpretive syntheses of data” (Sandelowski & Barroso, 2003, p. 227). | The meta-synthesis methodology developed as an outgrowth of the seminal qualitative synthesis methodology, meta-ethnography, and was conceived as a response to a parallel quantitative methodology, meta-analysis (e.g. Glass, 1976). Specifically, meta-synthesis is defined as “a form of systematic review or integration of qualitative research findings in a target domain that are themselves interpretive syntheses of data” (Sandelowski & Barroso, 2003, p. 227). |
| As mentioned previously, directed qualitative content analysis was used in determining relationships among the eleven references included in this study, a method of analysis appropriate for use when “existing theory or prior research exists about a phenomenon that is incomplete or would benefit from further description” (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005, p. 1281). | Directed qualitative content analysis, a deductive approach for analyzing qualitative data, was used in determining relationships among the eleven references included in this study. Hsieh and Shannon (2005) assert this method of analysis to be appropriate for use when “existing theory or prior research exists about a phenomenon that is incomplete or would benefit from further description” (p. 1281). |
| Initially, I established only three primary themes, a direct reflection of the sub-questions guiding the study as well as its key concepts and supporting theoretical framework: “factors,” meaning identified factors of influence on the supervisory triad; ~~“patterns of communication,” meaning the patterns of communication recognized as occurring within the data;~~ and “positioning,” meaning the positioning of self and others within the supervisory triad. | Initially, I established only two primary themes, a direct reflection of the sub-questions guiding the study as well as its key concepts and supporting theoretical framework: “factors,” meaning identified factors of influence on the supervisory triad; and “positioning,” meaning the positioning of self and others within the supervisory triad. |
| Institutions of higher education implementing pre-service teacher clinical experiences could benefit greatly from making these shifts—as teacher candidates’ learning increases, it is likely that their overall knowledge and skill levels will increase as well, potentially leading to higher achievement on professional licensure assessments ~~such as the Praxis or edTPA~~ required for certification and eventual employment. | Institutions of higher education implementing pre-service teacher clinical experiences could benefit greatly from making these shifts—as teacher candidates’ learning increases, it is likely that their overall knowledge and level of skill will increase as well, potentially leading to higher achievement on professional licensure assessments required for certification and eventual employment. |
| **Reference List Revisions** | |
| ~~Britten, N., Garside, R., Pope, C., Frost, J., & Cooper, C. (2017). Asking more of qualitative synthesis: A response to Sally Thorne.~~ *~~Qualitative Health Research, 27~~*~~(9), 1370-1376. doi: 10.1177/1049732317709010~~  ~~Burns, R. W. & Badiali, B. (2016). Unearthing the complexities of clinical pedagogy in supervision: Identifying the pedagogical skills of supervisors.~~ *~~Action in Teacher Education, 38~~*~~(2). http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2016.1155097~~  ~~Darling-Hammond, L. (1999). America's future: Educating teachers.~~ *~~Education Digest, 64~~*~~(9), 18-23.~~ | Three references removed – not cited in the paper |
| Gee, J. (~~2000~~ 2001). Identity as an analytic lens for research in education. In W. Secada (Ed*.), Review of research in education* (Vol. 25, pp. 99-125). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.  Strieker, T., Adams, M., Lim, W., & Wright, M. (2017~~a~~). Using discourse analysis to understand the relationships and practices of pre-service co-teachers. *Georgia Educational Researcher, 14*(1), 40-68. doi: 10.20429/ger.2017.140102 | Two references revised – incorrect date notation |
| Glass, G. V. (1976). Primary, secondary, and meta-analysis of research. *Educational Researcher, 5*(10), 3-8.  Sandelowski, M. & Barroso, J. (2003). Creating metasummaries of qualitative findings. *Nursing Research, 52*(4), 226-233. | Two references added to list – cited in paper |
| **Other Revisions** | |
| - APA formatting updated to 7th ed. throughout paper  - Minor grammatical revisions made throughout paper | |