2019

Coordination Sensation: When NGOs Strike Down Sex Trafficking

Megan Prangley
Georgia Southern University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.georgiasouthern.edu/honors-theses

Part of the International and Area Studies Commons, Migration Studies Commons, and the Organization Development Commons

Recommended Citation

This thesis (open access) is brought to you for free and open access by Digital Commons@Georgia Southern. It has been accepted for inclusion in University Honors Program Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons@Georgia Southern. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@georgiasouthern.edu.
Coordination Sensation: When NGOs Strike Down Sex Trafficking

An Honors Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for Honors in International Studies.

By
Megan Prangley

Under the mentorship of Dr. Courtney Burns

Human sex trafficking is a form of modern-day slavery that is prevalent in the United States and across the globe. Currently, a number of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) exist to diminish sex trafficking. I seek to discover how powerful the efforts of NGOs are in combating sex trafficking. I argue that NGOs are successful in combating sex trafficking to the extent that their efforts are coordinated. Although an NGO may experience individual success in decreasing sex trafficking in a given area, without coordinating their efforts with the efforts of other NGOs, they will lack attaining the full knowledge, power, and resources that are useful in combating sex trafficking. I test this argument on the domestic level by conducting interviews among sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah, Georgia. I ask these NGOs about the capacity of their funding and expertise, with whom they coordinate their efforts, and their perceived level of success of their efforts. I couple interview responses alongside data on the number of sex trafficking victims in Savannah over a ten year period. I find that there is a lack of coordination among NGOs in Savannah. While this lack of coordination does not support my hypotheses, I find that there is a desire among sex trafficking NGOs to coordinate their efforts, and it is likely that increased coordination among these NGOs would increase their effectiveness in combating sex trafficking.

Thesis Mentor: ____________________________
Dr. Courtney Burns

Honors Director: __________________________
Dr. Steven Engel

April 2019
Department of Political Science and International Studies
University Honors Program
Georgia Southern University
Acknowledgements

1 Corinthians 10:31: “So, whether you eat or drink, or whatever you do, do all to the glory of God.”

In light of studying the heartbreaking topic of sex trafficking that is reality for millions worldwide, I am thankful that a good God is at work amidst brokenness, even when it is in ways we cannot comprehend. It is my hope that tragedies such as sex trafficking are put to an end, so that more people may live in light of their God-given freedoms. Thank you to the ministry of Campus Outreach for equipping me to live out my faith in everything I do. Thank you for encouraging me through the laughs and tears that life brings. Thank you for reminding me that God is sovereign and present in all things.

Thank you to my mother for encouraging me to attend Georgia Southern University, as my experience involved the opportunity to write this undergraduate honors thesis and much more. Thank you to my father who supports me by listening to me discuss my research and sharing my love for traveling worldwide. Thank you to my younger sisters, Abbey and Lauren, for not only being cheerleaders on the football field, but in my life. I love all of you more than you know and am grateful we have grown closer as time continues to flash before our eyes.

Thank you to my professors, Dr. Jamie Scalera and Dr. Courtney Burns. I am grateful for Dr. Scalera’s patience with me as I struggled to choose a research topic, asked questions in chains of emails, and cried in her office through stress. I am grateful for Dr. Burns agreeing to be my research mentor and guiding me throughout the process of writing this thesis. I look up to your commitment to research as you balance your personal life. This thesis would not be complete and opportunities to present my research would not have been possible without encouragement from both of you. Beyond my thesis, thank you both for constantly taking the time to advise and support me on my future endeavors. You both have made a tremendous impact on my life and I value you more than my words can express.

Lastly, thank you to everyone that was involved in my research process. Thank you to everyone that touched my life during my time at Georgia Southern University. I wish you the best and am confident and excited as I embrace the future due to your involvement in my life. Always remember that you are a blessing to me.
Introduction

Operation Dark Night was a sting operation that sex trafficked dozens of women in Savannah, among other locations in the Southeastern United States (U.S.) (U.S. Department of Justice 2014). This operation recruited women from Latin America by providing them with false hopes of attaining the American dream, as they were instead forced into sexual activities with up to 50 people a day (U.S. Department of Justice 2014). While the U.S. government convicted 23 defendants involved in Operation Dark Night in 2014, sex trafficking injustices continue in the Savannah area (U.S. Department of Justice 2014). As the act of sex trafficking captures people in bondage across the globe, it is vital to study what factors successfully liberate victims from bondage or hinder their freedom.

Thirteen years ago, an estimated 12.3 million persons were trapped within the realm of human trafficking (Hepburn and Simon 2013). Presently, these estimates are only increasing, as an estimated 40.3 million persons were victims of human trafficking in 2017 (International Labour Organization and Walk Free Foundation 2017). Thus, it is crucial that the scale and gruesome effects of human trafficking are brought to the attention of the global population, as all genders and ages are vulnerable targets (Hepburn and Simon 2013). Andrea Bertone (2009) highlights that even the most developed areas in the U.S. are not immune from the horrors of human trafficking.

Within the realm of human trafficking, there are distinct types. There may be overlap among these types, as a person may go back and forth between being smuggled, trafficked, and engaged in prostitution by choice (Bertone 2009). Nevertheless, the International Standardized Anti-Trafficking Law details human trafficking as the recruitment, threat or use of coercion against, and exploitation of persons in the United
Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (Hepburn and Simon 2013). In my research, I focus on sex trafficking, which is human trafficking that involves sexual exploitation (Hepburn and Simon 2013). I hone in on sex trafficking, because it arguably involves the most morbid acts against trafficked persons. It is of utmost importance to put a halt to sex trafficking.

In 2011, the U.S. invested approximately 9.8 million dollars into anti-trafficking programs for foreign, national, and domestic trafficking victims (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services 2018). Currently, the amount of funding for anti-trafficking programs is increasing, as the U.S. budgeted approximately 23.8 million dollars into these anti-trafficking programs in 2018 (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services 2018). In light of significant funding being fueled to sex trafficking non-governmental organizations (NGOs), I am interested in evaluating the effectiveness of these NGOs in decreasing sex trafficking. That is, how powerful are NGOs in combating sex trafficking? Furthermore, what properties of NGOs lead to a decrease in sex trafficking?

I argue that NGOs are quite powerful in combating sex trafficking, to the extent that they coordinate their efforts with other NGOs. I investigate sex trafficking NGOs to evaluate whether or not coordination exists and if so, if it impacts their effectiveness. I define effectiveness as whether the number of sex trafficking victims in a given area has increased or decreased. Within this research I unite the existing literature that examines the effectiveness of NGOs with the topic of sex trafficking. I contribute to the existing literature on the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs by analyzing how the presence or absence of coordination affects their efforts.
I focus on the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah, Georgia. Savannah is an ideal place to research the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs, because Savannah is along two interstates, I-95 and I-16, which continuously involves the large movement of people. I-95 has been used to transport women caught in sex trafficking, as it extends up the U.S. East Coast from Savannah (Lebos 2016). Additionally, I-95 and I-16 connect to Atlanta, which is one of the largest hubs for sex trafficking in the U.S. Furthermore, as a coastal and port city, Savannah has been recognized as a hub for sex trafficking (Howard 2018). Georgia ranks sixth in the U.S. for containing the most cases of sex trafficking (Howard 2018). To diminish sex trafficking and prevent cases such as Operation Dark Night from reoccurring, it is important to research what factors contribute to the demise of sex trafficking.

Literature Review

Human Trafficking

Human trafficking exists in many forms and is defined as “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force...for the purpose of exploitation” (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2018). Human trafficking is prompted in a variety of ways and manifested in various forms. It is first important to identify the roots of human trafficking, to provide a working framework for all of the factors that may contribute to the existence of human trafficking.

Scholars have examined what conditions lead to higher or lower rates of trafficking. Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer (2013) examine two arguments on the relationship between sex trafficking and prostitution. The first argument argues that the
effects on a state’s inflow of human trafficking is likely to increase if prostitution is legalized (Cho et al. 2013). This is described by the scale effect, or an increase in the scale of legalized prostitution leading to an increase in the demand for and scale of human trafficking (Cho et al. 2013, p. 25). The second argument proposes that the substitution effect pushes human trafficking clients away from illegally trafficked prostitutes and non-prostitutes and towards legally residing prostitutes in a given state (Cho et al. 2013, p. 10). Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer (2013) find that the substitution effect will reduce the demand for trafficked prostitutes. They conclude that legalized prostitution leads to an increase in the number of human trafficking cases (Cho et al. 2013).

Case studies reveal that natural disasters promote conditions for human trafficking (Hepburn and Simon 2012). For example, Thai nationals were labor trafficked in the Gulf Coast region of the U.S. after Hurricane Katrina, as they filled the high demand for low wage work that often arises in the aftermath of natural disasters (Hepburn and Simon 2010).

Also, the U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) allegedly targeted trafficking victims to fill the required number of arrest quotas of fugitives to use the lengthy process it takes to attain legal status against them (Hepburn and Simon 2010). Thus, human trafficking victims may be targeted through immigration enforcement (Hepburn and Simon 2010).

The way in which a state regulates human trafficking also affects the prevalence of human trafficking. States may regulate human trafficking through either a legal, noncriminal, tolerant, or prohibitionist lens (Chuang 2010). If a state assumes a
prohibitionist perspective, in which they implement health checks and licensing requirements to cases of prostitution, human trafficking is less likely to prevail because of stricter laws (Chuang 2010). Therefore, how a government legally handles human trafficking affects the targeting and overall rate of human trafficking (Lansink 2006). It is important to identify the factors that either foster or discourage the prevalence of sex trafficking for sex trafficking NGOs to be effective.

Further, researchers have examined the effectiveness of human trafficking prevention measures, which are fundamental to analyzing the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs. Current literature assesses the competency of responses to human trafficking, such as the U.S. Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) and other similar policies (Bertone 2009). The TVPA was enacted in 2002 to punish traffickers and protect victims by enforcing international prevention measures (Nam 2007, p. 1656). Yet, the enforcement of the TVPA among other similar policies is deemed problematic, because ambiguities in defining human trafficking make it difficult to establish anti-sex trafficking policies (Bertone 2009).

Additionally, politicians with opposing beliefs on whether sex trafficking, labor trafficking, or prostitution is more worthy of being combated may halt the enforcement of human trafficking laws (Hepburn and Simon 2010). This was the case when politicians disagreed on the priorities of the New York State Anti-Trafficking Law (Hepburn and Simon 2010). Therefore, while copious amounts of domestic, NGO, foreign investment, and advocacy efforts are active in combating human trafficking, there must be stricter implementation and enforcement of anti-trafficking laws (Hepburn and Simon 2010).
Nam (2007) concludes that to be effective, anti-trafficking laws must include structures that empower victims to be protected, such as access to civil rights lawyers and greater compensation from court hearings. It is essential to know the varying roots of human trafficking and the effectiveness of anti-trafficking laws. This knowledge provides insight into factors sex trafficking NGOs may encounter through their efforts, along with areas NGOs may be able to make improvements in anti-trafficking laws through advocacy.

Sex Trafficking

Scholars analyze the evolution and types of human trafficking. Within the realm of human trafficking, I focus on sex trafficking. The current literature proposes that sex trafficking emerged as a global issue in the 1990s (Bertone 2009). Unlike women of color from Africa and Asia that had previously migrated to the U.S., the new trafficking victims that migrated in the 1990s identified more with the middle class and politicians (Bertone 2009, p. 265). This expanded the scope of sex trafficking, as all people became vulnerable. Therefore, this expanded the scope of the efforts of sex trafficking NGOs.

Human trafficking has developed as a global issue through the media’s portrayal of human trafficking victims as helpless (Bertone 2009). This has also furthered awareness of human trafficking to the public (Bertone 2009). In particular, sex trafficking is more publicized through the media than other forms of human trafficking (Hepburn and Simon 2010). Human trafficking as a global issue through the media outlets is important as I research the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs, because scholars focus on how networks produced from globalization are effective in decreasing sex trafficking.
Although human trafficking may capture both men and women, it is deemed as a gender-based harm, specifically targeting women (Lansink 2006). Women are more vulnerable to trafficking as a result of gender discrimination rooted in traditional cultural practices, unequal educational opportunities, and less opportunities to own property (Lansink 2006). Likewise, socioeconomic factors such as poverty and the poor protection of labor forces foster human trafficking (Chuang 2010). It is important to identify the primary targets of sex trafficking, as it reveals populations that NGOs may need to invest more of their attention.

Among the types of human trafficking, existing literature investigates the disparities between sex trafficking and labor trafficking. Labor trafficking refers to individuals being trafficked for their labor, which often involves entrapment through exorbitant fees or debt bondage (Hepburn and Simon 2010). For example, East Africans labor trafficked in the Middle East were forced into domestic work and often abused (Feingold 2005). Current literature denotes that while sex trafficking is prevalent in the U.S., labor trafficking also comprises a large amount of the human trafficking cases in the United States. The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime discovered that 46.2% of trafficking cases in the U.S. involve agricultural slavery, food and care services, domestic services, and the garment industry (Hepburn and Simon 2010, p. 4). The literature on labor trafficking in comparison to sex trafficking reveals the wide spectrum in which human trafficking occurs. Although I focus on sex trafficking in my research, understanding labor trafficking provides a framework of comparison to shape an individual’s perception of human trafficking.
As the prevalence of sex trafficking is a global phenomenon, scholars research what it entails, how it compares to other types of human trafficking, and who its targets are. An understanding of how media contributes to the public’s greater awareness of sex trafficking is vital, because increased awareness may further decrease sex trafficking in the long-term (Hepburn and Simon 2010). As I unite the topic of sex trafficking with the work of NGOs, it is important to distinguish who the targets are and how sex trafficking differs from labor trafficking. These distinctions provide a framework for which populations NGOs should focus on and how NGOs may effectively decrease sex trafficking among other types.

The Role and Structure of NGOs

Over the past four decades, NGOs have increasingly filled areas in which the government is lacking, which includes a government not advocating for their people or not having the resources to do so (Kaloudis 2017). NGOs are independent, private actors that work for the public good (Martens 2002). Along with the role advocacy NGOs play in addressing development issues, NGOs may also engage in grassroots mobilization, service delivery, compliance monitoring, fundraising management, and research (Prakash 2010).

The role of NGOs has increased as a result of globalization, natural disasters, and the political sphere not providing equity for all individuals (Kaloudis 2017). However, current literature finds that the first development organizations to fill governmental gaps were largely inefficient as a result of scarce resources, dysfunctional administrative capacities, and detachment from their beneficiaries (Jonathan 1997). Thus,
these organizations failed at their objective of improving the material, emotional, and social needs of their beneficiaries (Prakash 2010).

As a result, Jonathan (1997) hones in on the design of development organizations, which is fundamental to understanding their role. The design and role of development organizations is applicable to the design and role of sex trafficking NGOs, because both types may benefit from similar organizational structures as they seek to improve overarching social issues (Jonathan 1997). Jonathan (1997) identifies that it is essential for development organizations to be flexible in how problems are approached, as closed-mindedness does not lead to opportunities for a better tomorrow. Additionally, scholars determine that general employees and specialists of development organizations must be flexible regarding their skills (Jonathan 1997). For instance, if employees can manage their responsibilities while also handling the responsibilities of their co-workers when absent, then an organization can make quick decisions based on shared knowledge, rather than relying on individuals (Jonathan 1997).

Research also studies multilateralism, which involves organizations being indivisible, non-discriminate, and reciprocal to one another’s needs (Martin 1992). Multilateralism relates to sex trafficking NGOs in cases that involve sex trafficking NGOs working together. In particular, Seybolt (2009) identifies size, complexity, differentiation, stability, connectivity, and centrality as core factors that constitute humanitarian aid networks, which uphold multilateral structures. Although networks often fall short in sustaining their services, functional specializations, and stability within a network, there is much potential for non-state actors who cooperate in a network to fulfill their goals if they focus on improving in these areas (Seybolt 2009).
The multilateral structure may be difficult to establish but has the potential to boost the adaptability and endurance of organizations (Ruggie 1992). Further, in the long-run multilateral structures may lower an organization’s economic costs and increase stability among states (Martin 1992). Similar to multilateralism, Jonathan (1997) argues that development organizations heighten their capacity to address development issues if they maintain flat structures, because the control aspect of hierarchical structures may hinder organizational growth.

Politics may also influence the role of NGOs, as some NGOs are created by the government and are often chief beneficiaries of particular regulations within the political system (Prakash 2010). In regards to the political system, Reimann (2006) discloses that citizen groups who attain political resources, such as institutional financial support or political access to those who make key decisions, are likely to advance their role in acquiring change.

Thus, NGOs champion multiple roles, which are most effective when supported by proper structures. Following the current literature, the most effective structures for NGOs include internally flat and externally multilateral structures (Jonathan 1997; Martin 1992). It is important to recognize what structures best support the role of NGOs, because without optimal structures sex trafficking NGOs will not fulfill their full potential to effectively decrease sex trafficking when combining their knowledge on their structures.

**International Networking Between NGOs**

As organizations increasingly encompass the global sphere, scholars concentrate on the impacts of international networking between organizations. This research is
important in analyzing the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs, because I argue that networking between sex trafficking NGOs increases their effectiveness. First, policy networks are networks in which NGOs combine their resources to advance their policy goals and the sustainability of organizational structures that support their policy goals (Ohanyan 2009). To establish policy networks, organizations start by pinpointing common issues and the desired outcomes they wish to strive together towards (Prakash 2010). Yet, after organizations identify a common vision and form advocacy networks, to what extent are networks effective?

Keck and Sikkink (1999) focus on whether or not Transnational Advocacy Networks (TANs) can prompt transnational change and if so, under what conditions. TANs are global networks of member NGOs that aim to advocate for their values to a populace in which a member NGO exists (Keck and Sikkink 1999). Keck and Sikkink (1999) feature TANs as communicative bodies that directly influence the diffusion of new priorities across transnational borders through a “boomerang pattern” (pp. 93-94). The boomerang pattern refers to domestic and foreign NGOs uniting to externally and internally pressure a government to change their behavior for the better (Keck and Sikkink 1999).

Additionally, network theory may explain transnational change, which involves the transformation of a state resulting from non-state actors interacting with state actors and one another (Keck and Sikkink 1999). Yet, this is a cautionary conclusion, as it includes that the transformative properties of TANs may be limited due to certain NGOs participating in TANs only to the extent that they attain mutual respect, knowledge, and benefits (Keck and Sikkink 1999). Nevertheless, the boomerang pattern and network
theory are essential to my research, because they unravel how the communicative properties of NGOs provides them power to create transformative change.

In contrast to this boomerang pattern, Pallas (2016) recognizes an inverse boomerang pattern, which involves NGOs contacting local partners to garner support for their objectives in light of crooked political systems (p. 282). However, local partners are often people groups within the Global South (Pallas 2016). Thus, as NGOs communicate with a particular people group they risk marginalizing another people group and dismissing accountability, as it could diminish the power local partners have over the actions of NGOs (Pallas 2016). As a result of potentially undermining local representation, the inverse boomerang pattern is a paradox in opposition to the aforementioned boomerang pattern (Pallas 2016). It is important to recognize how the inverse boomerang pattern diminishes accountability, because when examining sex trafficking NGOs I consider the impact of the presence or absence of accountability.

Risse, Ropp, and Sikkink (2007) examine the “spiral model” (p. 267). The spiral model suggests that the mobilization properties of TANs are vital in prompting change for weak domestic populations, as increased pressure “from below” and “from above” causes transnational change to cause domestic change (Risse 2007, p. 267). Indeed, they found that the actions of TANs strengthen human rights within the domestic sphere (Risse 2007). Therefore, TANs may have impact on the transnational level.

Similarly, Murdie and Davis (2012) analyze whether the “naming and shaming” of states by Human Rights Organizations (HROs), which involves HROs shaming states for their malpractices, improves the human rights performance of a state. In a similar way, sex trafficking NGOs may partake in shaming through revealing when the government
deliberately neglects taking appropriate actions against sex trafficking. Murdie and Davis (2012) find that shaming from HROs does not in itself lead to an improved human rights performance, but that shaming from HROs leads to an improved human rights performance when paired with domestic advocacy efforts “from below” and pressure “from above” (p. 3).

In a like manner, Wilson, Davis, and Murdie (2016) found that the sole presence of Conflict Resolution Organizations (CROs) within a state is insufficient in achieving their goals to reduce international conflict. These findings are important parallels to sex trafficking NGOs that maintain their presence within states as they inform communities of injustices. In particular, research strongly supports that CROs providing information to citizens in a state regarding a particular conflict decreases the prevalence of that particular conflict (Wilson et al. 2016). Overall, the shaming of HROs and the presence of CROs alone are not sufficient in improving human rights practices or reducing international conflict, as domestic advocacy efforts and the informative properties of CROs are required, respectively (Murdie and Davis 2012; Wilson et al. 2016).

In contrast, increased shaming is enough in itself to negatively influence public opinion within a given state (Davis et al. 2012). The “CNN effect” explains how the media attracting public interest towards an issue causes the public to demand action from their leaders, as shaming stirs grievances among the public (Murdie and Peksen 2013, p. 215). Thus, increased shaming from the media showcasing injustices leads a domestic public to question the level of respect their government has for human rights, which paves the way to change (Davis et al. 2012). This is applicable to my research, as I
account for how sex trafficking NGOs raise awareness in the public sphere and how this impacts their effectiveness.

However, Ausderan (2014) claims that although shaming may halt a government’s abuse of human rights, shaming may also have the opposite effect. On one hand, shaming a government may decrease human rights violations if a government is seeking to limit the amount of pressure being placed on their government (Ausderan 2014). On the other hand, shaming a government may increase human rights violations if a government responds to threats by displaying their power (Ausderan 2014). In theory, a government responding to threats with repression to eliminate threats from dissidents is referred to as the law of coercive responsiveness (Regilme 2014). Therefore, a fine line exists between the effectiveness of governmental shaming.

Still, Murdie and Davis (2012) argue that shaming from HROs will lead to greater respect for human rights. The shaming must be paired with targeting from third-party actors and third-party actors plus large numbers of HROs within the targeted state, because of strength in numbers and rule consistent behavior being expected from the international sphere (Murdie and Davis 2012). Support is found for this argument, which demonstrates that HRO shaming does have an impact on the human rights practices (Murdie and Davis 2012).

Specifically, environmental international nongovernmental organizations (INGOs) have shamed states by projecting the desires of environmentalists in states with incompetent political institutions (Murdie and Urpelainen 2015). INGOs promote sound environmental governance by holding governments accountable to addressing the desires
of environmentalists, which affirms the effectiveness of shaming (Murdie and Urpelainen 2015).

The “Amnesty International effect” describes how HRO shaming activities increase the likelihood of humanitarian armed interventions (Murdie and Peksen 2013). Murdie and Bhasin (2011) disclose that HRO actions that incorporate the participation of locals in permanent locations cultivate greater amounts of violent and nonviolent protests against a state (Murdie and Bhasin 2011).

The current literature highlights how shaming, the media, humanitarian armed interventions, protests, and general pressures placed on governments are likely to increase governmental respect for human rights. This lays a foundation for my research, because I analyze how sex trafficking NGOs bringing awareness to the public impacts the government and affects the effectiveness of NGOs.

*Governments and NGOs*

Along with various NGOs prompting change by placing pressure on governments, scholars focus on how international and domestic governmental actions may prompt state compliance and the resulting responses of NGOs (Dai 2005). Their findings have implications for the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs, because it is essential to account for how governmental actions affect the strategies of NGOs.

International institutions monitor whether states comply with the treaties they commit to (Dai 2005). As international institutions monitor, they gain shareable compliance information, which may induce compliant state behavior through reciprocity (Dai 2005). Furthermore, the “domestic enforcement model” analyzes the compliance
level of states, as electoral pressure from future elections and the availability of informational knowledge at the public’s disposal causes a government to comply with the treaties they sign at some level (Dai 2005). Indeed, whether through their ability to vote or mobilize support on behalf of public compliance information from international institutions, domestic mechanisms fuel state compliance (Dai 2005).

Still, as a result of collective action issues that arise due to the prisoner’s dilemma model, which is the conflict between social incentives to cooperate and private incentives to deflect, governments commit injustices (Holt and Capra, 2000, p. 229). Fortunately, NGOs have the ability to overcome governmental injustices and collective action problems created when governments fail to cooperate with others by acting in their own best interest (Dai 2002). For example, victims of noncompliance usually report noncompliance to their state to set an issue on the international agenda (Dai 2002). Yet, if the agenda of a state does not align with the requests of noncompliance victims, people are left powerless (Dai 2002). Thus, Dai (2002) recognizes the opportunity of NGOs to safeguard noncompliance victims by highlighting noncompliance issues within the public sphere.

Although not perfect monitors, NGOs have the power to protect noncompliance victims, because they have the ability to single out issues, unlike states that must remain unbiased within their systematic organization that monitors the enforcement of government policies (Dai 2002). Therefore, whether NGOs use their leverage to hold governments accountable for injustices they commit or domestic mechanisms such as future voting prompt the public’s power over the government, the actions of the government are affected by both NGOs and the public (Dai 2002, 2005).
The domestic enforcement model is essential to identifying whether or not future electoral pressures and public awareness of sex trafficking impacts the prevalence of sex trafficking in Savannah. I consider whether the domestic enforcement model increases the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs, as Dai (2002) suggests the public will turn to NGOs when the government is noncompliant.

**NGOs Combating Sex Trafficking**

Past research reveals the horrors of sex trafficking and the hope brought from NGOs. Davy (2013) unifies these two topics by analyzing how TANs are successfully combating child sex trafficking in the Greater Mekong Sub-region. TANs in this region have attained new legislation against child trafficking by combining their lobbying efforts and working together to improve child protection systems (Davy 2013). Their efforts have produced greater justice within local law enforcement systems in regards to child trafficking (Davy 2013). A vital factor in the success of TANs in this region is that they have coordinated their efforts, which has provided a greater abundance of services to assist victims (Davy 2013).

The actions of these TANs have furthered the proliferation of the anti-trafficking movement on the global scale (Davy 2013). Through their legislative efforts, TANs have placed sex trafficking on the global policy agenda (Davy 2013). Along with this, NGOs have a greater openness in delivering healthcare services to sex trafficking victims than governments (Williams et al. 2010). This reveals that NGOs have potential to effectively
aid vulnerable populations if their anti-trafficking programs are coordinated with other anti-sex trafficking programs (Williams et al. 2010).

Noyori-Corbett and Moxley (2017) research how Japanese sex trafficking NGOs engage in TANs to prevent sex trafficking recruitment in various countries. Despite this, assistance for sex trafficking victims is often postponed as a result of sex trafficking NGOs having weak organizational capacities and limited resources, along with poor institutional and policy support in regards to combating sex trafficking (Noyori-Corbett and Moxley 2017). Thus, it would be beneficial if Japanese sex trafficking NGOs generated collective responses to assist sex trafficking victims by combining the efforts of domestic employers, social services, and governments (Noyori-Corbett and Moxley 2017). Then, not only will domestic organizations strengthen their assistance to sex trafficking victims, but TANs will be able to effectively coordinate “reactive and proactive responses to human trafficking” (Noyori-Corbett and Moxley 2017, p. 13).

Another study evaluates the potential of healthcare systems to fight against sex trafficking in Manila, a metropolitan area in the Philippines (Williams et al. 2010). This study finds that interview respondents desired the coordination of anti-trafficking healthcare efforts in light of finding a more effective healthcare response to trafficking (Williams et al. 2010). Although the Department of Social Welfare and Development is the governmental unit in the Philippines that oversees the coordination of services for rescued trafficking victims, governments often look to NGOs to coordinate services for victims (Williams et al. 2010).

Lastly, Wennerholm (2002) highlights more than 80 organizations that work to combat sex trafficking in the Baltic Region (pp. 16-17). This project details how
domestic NGOs hosting workshops for actors fighting against sex trafficking has prompted domestic networks that aim to diminish sex trafficking (Wennerholm 2002). Wennerholm (2002) finds that domestic networks that are connected and keep one another informed increases the sustainability and credibility of individual NGOs within the networks. It is likely that NGOs that intentionally coordinate their efforts will maximize the services provided to victims of sex trafficking and that, together, TANs will be more effective in combating sex trafficking (Davy, 2013).

In all, sex trafficking is a gruesome form of human trafficking that may be caused by the gender of an individual, higher rates of prostitution within an area, natural disasters, or immigration enforcement (Cho et al. 2013; Hepburn and Simon 2010, 2012; Lansink 2006). Scholars have analyzed the effectiveness of human trafficking prevention measures, such as anti-trafficking laws and NGO advocacy efforts (Bertone 2009; Hepburn and Simon 2010; Nam 2007). While evaluating the effectiveness of NGO advocacy, it is important to understand how the structures of NGOs influence their roles, because if NGOs have weak structures they are less likely to decrease sex trafficking (Jonathan 1997).

Finally, networking through TANs and pressures placed on governments through shaming and the media are making improvements regarding certain social issues, which is important because it is likely that sex trafficking will decrease more if sex trafficking NGOs network with one another and pressure governments (Davis et al. 2012; Keck and Sikkink 1999; Murdie and Bhasin 2011; Murdie and Davis 2012; Murdie and Peksen 2013; Risse 2007). Additionally, through NGOs projecting the desires of their citizens to governments or exposing areas of governmental noncompliance, NGOs have the
opportunity to hold governments accountable for acting against injustices in the public sphere (Dai 2002, 2005; Murdie and Urpelainen 2015). This relates to NGOs potentially having the power to effectively decrease sex trafficking. Overall, scholars researching how varying forms of coordination have effectively combated sex trafficking in the Greater Mekong Subregion, Japan, the Philippines, and the Baltic Region display much hope in the coordination of NGOs to effectively decrease sex trafficking (Davy 2013; Noyori-Corbett and Moxley 2017; Wennerholm 2002; Noyori-Corbett and Moxley 2017).

Although current literature addresses different aspects of NGOs and the topic of sex trafficking, there is a shortage of research that unites the topics of NGOs and sex trafficking, especially in regards to the effectiveness of NGOs in decreasing sex trafficking. In my research, I contribute to the existing literature on the role of NGOs, their effectiveness, and what conditions contribute to their effectiveness. I focus on sex trafficking NGOs combining their knowledge and capacity, along with coordinating their efforts with one another. In doing so, I seek how effective NGOs are in decreasing sex trafficking.

Theory

I argue that sex trafficking NGOs are powerful in decreasing sex trafficking to the extent that they coordinate their efforts with one another. First, I argue that if NGOs combine their knowledge with one another that they will decrease sex trafficking in the short-term. This follows Wennerholm’s (2002) logic that sex trafficking NGOs sharing their knowledge leads to greater effectiveness in victim assistance. Further, I argue that sex trafficking NGOs combining their capacity will decrease sex trafficking in the short-
term, as scholars argue that pressure on states “from above” and “from below,” along
with more monetary resources, will strengthen the force against sex trafficking (Davy
2013; Keck and Sikkink 1999; Murdie and Davis 2012; Risse 2007). Finally, I argue that
if sex trafficking NGOs coordinate the totality of their efforts that sex trafficking will
decrease in the long-term. This follows scholars describing NGOs as having the strongest
impact for awareness and preventative measures against sex trafficking in the long-term
when their efforts are coordinated (Davy 2013; Noyori-Corbett and Moxley 2017;
Seybolt 2009; Williams et al. 2010).

First, I argue that NGOs combining their knowledge will decrease sex trafficking
in the short-term. I define combining as NGOs sharing their knowledge. I define the
knowledge of an NGO as knowledge pertaining to what structural components and
strategies are used in the operation of the NGO. Structural components refers an NGO’s
management structure and how the strategies implemented by an NGO are delegated
among the staff. The short-term refers to the number of sex trafficking victims five years
ago, while long-term refers to the number of sex trafficking victims ten years ago.

Although an individual NGO possessing knowledge regarding their operations
may guide them towards fulfilling their goals, I argue that NGOs combining their
operative strategies will lead to greater effectiveness in decreasing sex trafficking in the
short-term. It is first important to highlight the knowledge an individual NGO holds in
regards to their own internal structure. If an NGO upholds an optimal structure but lacks
knowledge on their structure, then it will be difficult to discern whether knowledge
regarding their structure would be helpful when combined with the structural knowledge
of another NGO. If an NGO has a sub-optimal structure, it will not be effective if their
structural knowledge is shared with other NGOs. Still, NGOs with sub-optimal structures may learn from NGOs with optimal structures. I argue that combined knowledge enables sex trafficking NGOs to identify what structural components are most effective in decreasing sex trafficking.

I agree with Jonathan’s (1997) argument that the optimal internal structure for an NGO involves a flat structure. Flat structures include employees having the ability to perform many tasks within a given NGO (Jonathan 1997). This allows for quick decision making in the absence of individual employees and open-mindedness towards what strategies a NGO uses to diminish sex trafficking (Jonathan 1997).

If NGOs share their experience with one another regarding their structures, they will create an opportunity to learn what structural functionalities and strategies are best to decrease sex trafficking. NGOs sharing structural knowledge with one another will create a multilateral structure of sorts. Martin (1992) describes the multilateral structure in the context of states maintaining a structure in which states are indivisible, non-discriminate, and reciprocal to one another’s needs. I argue that NGOs that uphold a multilateral structure will be more likely to share and implement effective structural components of other NGOs, because they will have a common platform from which dialogue may be generated. Then, rather than an NGO perceiving their efforts as individual, they will realize the power in NGOs coming together to fulfill their common goals as a unit (Seybolt 2009).

If NGOs within a multilateral structure focus on improving the factors that comprise a multilateral structure with one another, I argue that the endurance of their organizations will increase (Ruggie 1992; Seybolt 2009). Seybolt (2009) identifies the
factors that comprise a multilateral structure as the size, complexity, differentiation, stability, connectivity, and centrality of an NGO among other NGOs. Following these factors, I posit that if NGOs combine their knowledge, then their organizations will endure longer and maintain greater stability (Ruggie 1992). This results from NGOs having the opportunity to learn what structures and strategies are most effective and what may be halting them from most effectively decreasing sex trafficking (Martin 1992; Ruggie 1992).

In all, I argue that NGOs combining their knowledge leads to a decrease in sex trafficking in the short-term. This follows my argument that the combination of knowledge will not be effective in the long-term unless NGOs intentionally coordinate all of their efforts. Through a sort of group trial and error, I argue that NGOs combining their knowledge will most effectively decrease sex trafficking in the short-term.

\[ H1: \text{If sex trafficking NGOs combine their knowledge with one another, then sex trafficking will decrease in the short-term.} \]

Next, I argue that sex trafficking NGOs combining their capacity will decrease sex trafficking in the short-term. I define the capacity of NGOs as their platform, interactions with the government and citizens, and monetary resources. I argue that the legitimacy and efforts of NGOs provide them with a platform from which awareness on sex trafficking may be expelled to the public. This is similar to Keck and Sikkink (1999) recognizing TANs as communicative bodies that can transfer awareness on an issue through international borders as a result of the “boomerang pattern” (pp. 93-94).
Although sex trafficking NGOs may not use their platform to pressure governments, the boomerang pattern demonstrates the power of awareness (Keck and Sikkink 1999).

If NGOs uncover cases of sex trafficking in word, deed, or through social media, I argue that the number of sex trafficking cases will decrease, because of pressure generated from above and from below. This follows the boomerang pattern and Risse, Ropp, and Sikkink’s (2007) spiral model, which explains how domestic change is prompted from the transnational level (Keck and Sikkink 1999). I argue that NGOs using their platform to uncover sex trafficking injustices will decrease sex trafficking in the short-term, because greater public knowledge of sex trafficking victims and the public pressuring the government for justice will inspire citizens to engage in the efforts of sex trafficking NGOs.

I argue that if NGOs collectively raise awareness of sex trafficking occurring within a given state, then more explicit action against sex trafficking will be taken by citizens. Actions may include but are not limited to anti-sex trafficking campaigns and material provisions for sex trafficking victims. Murdie and Davis (2012) recognize state shaming as a mechanism that generates pressure on state governments from above and from below. State shaming is one way in which NGOs may prompt awareness for citizens regarding a particular issue (Murdie and Davis 2012, p. 3). I argue that if sex trafficking NGOs jointly raise awareness through state shaming, then pressure on state governments will motivate more citizens to assist NGOs in promoting awareness, because citizens will realize how NGOs can step in when the government does not or cannot (Kaloudis 2017; Murdie and Davis 2012).
Following the logic behind Dai’s (2005) domestic enforcement model, I argue that if NGOs use their platform to share information related to sex trafficking with the public, then sex trafficking will decrease. I posit that public knowledge of injustices and greater trust in NGOs will cause more citizens to act against sex trafficking (Dai 2005). Dai (2002) researches noncompliance victims in the context of states not fulfilling their promises to other states. Aligned with Dai’s (2002) research, I argue that if citizens are victimized by a government that does not adequately address sex trafficking injustices, then the victimized citizens will support NGOs to secure justice against sex trafficking.

Davis, Murdie, and Steinmetz (2012) find that state shaming is not enough in itself to negatively influence a citizen’s opinions of a given injustice (Davis et al. 2012). Therefore, I argue that NGOs shedding light on sex trafficking injustices will cause citizens to perceive sex trafficking negatively, which will cause more citizens to fight against sex trafficking (Davis et al. 2012). Along with this, Murdie and Peksen (2013) highlight the CNN effect. I posit that NGOs engaging the media to attract public interest towards sex trafficking injustices will cause the public to demand action from their leaders, as a result of stirred public grievances (Murdie and Peksen 2013, p. 215). Furthermore, public interest spurred by the media will lead citizens to demand action from NGOs when the government does not advocate for or lacks the resources to address sex trafficking injustices (Kaloudis 2017; Murdie and Peksen 2013).

Lastly, I argue that NGOs that combine their monetary funds will be more effective in decreasing sex trafficking, because they will collectively have more money to commit to decreasing sex trafficking. Martin (1992) finds that NGOs within multilateral structures have the potential to lower their organization’s economic costs. I posit that sex
trafficking NGOs combining their monetary resources will lower economic costs for individual NGOs and provide opportunity for the monetary resources of NGOs to make a greater impact (Martin 1992). Additionally, Reimann (2006) evaluates that citizens who obtain institutional financial support are more likely to acquire the change they desire. Following this, I argue that NGOs combining institutional financial support they receive will further decrease sex trafficking, as combined monetary resources are more effective, because overlaps regarding where monetary resources are spent may also be accounted for.

Overall, I argue that while an individual NGO’s platform, relationship with the government and citizens, and monetary resources may decrease sex trafficking, combining these components between NGOs will most effectively decrease sex trafficking, because with more power there is a greater capacity. Therefore, I argue that NGOs combining their capacity leads to a decrease in sex trafficking in the short-term. This argument is framed in the short-term, because I argue that the combination of capacity will not be effective in the long-term unless NGOs intentionally coordinate the totality of their efforts. Yet, through exposing unjust actions, unraveling where governments lack and citizens grieve, and having greater monetary funds, I argue that NGOs combining their capacity will most effectively decrease sex trafficking in the short-term.

H2: If sex trafficking NGOs combine their capacity, then sex trafficking will decrease in the short-term.
Altogether, I argue that NGOs that coordinate the totality of their efforts most effectively decrease sex trafficking in the long-term. I define coordination as intentional connection between NGOs that goes beyond combining knowledge and capacity in the short-term, or whenever needed or convenient. While it is effective for NGOs to combine their knowledge and capacity, I posit that NGOs that intentionally coordinate their efforts will most effectively decrease sex trafficking in the long-term. This follows Davy’s (2013) research on the coordination of sex trafficking NGOs in the Greater Mekong Sub-region. I argue that if NGOs fail to connect their knowledge, capacity, and the totality of their efforts with one another, then their efforts will be hindered from reaching their full potential. Together, NGOs expand their knowledge and capacity, and thus power, through which they can fight against sex trafficking.

Sex trafficking NGOs in the Greater Mekong Sub-region increased protection against sex trafficking in local law enforcement systems by combining their lobbying efforts to improve child protection services (Davy 2013). I argue that if sex trafficking NGOs work together to advocate for and improve sex trafficking victim services, then sex trafficking victim services will improve. Victim services will improve, because coordination will produce more efforts working to decrease sex trafficking, which will produce a greater impact.

Scholars have linked coordination between sex trafficking NGOs with NGOs more effectively aiding vulnerable populations (Williams et al. 2010). Furthermore, Davy (2013) finds that coordination among sex trafficking NGOs maximizes the number of services for victims. Noyori-Corbett and Moxley (2017) deem sex trafficking victim assistance in Japan to be weak. They argue that sex trafficking NGOs combining their
efforts with domestic employers, social services, and governments with relation to combating sex trafficking will provide the greatest assistance to sex trafficking victims. I argue that if sex trafficking NGOs coordinate their efforts with one another that more services will be available to sex trafficking victims, because through coordination NGOs can combine, expand, or improve their victim services. This will increase the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs.

Wennerholm (2002) emphasizes that coordination between NGOs leads to NGOs keeping one another informed, which increases their sustainability through networking and credibility through greater trust among one another. Ohanyan (2009) recognizes that NGOs combining their resources in policy networks generates more sustainable organizational structures. I argue that sex trafficking NGOs coordinating their efforts will cause greater trust between sex trafficking NGOs and greater endurance in their efforts. This will promote the longevity of sex trafficking NGOs.

While NGOs may have similar motives in their efforts to combat sex trafficking, if sex trafficking NGOs coordinate their efforts with one another their effectiveness will increase. Sex trafficking NGOs will increase their effectiveness through coordination, because it will lead to a network of sex trafficking NGOs characterized by longevity, transparency, and the optimization of their services for sex trafficking victims. Therefore, I argue that NGOs that coordinate the totality of their efforts to diminish sex trafficking will be the most effective in decreasing sex trafficking in the long-term.

*H3: If sex trafficking NGOs coordinate their efforts, then sex trafficking will decrease in the long-term.*
Research Design

If NGOs coordinate the totality of their efforts, then they will increase their effectiveness in the long-term. To test this relationship, I conduct a qualitative analysis to determine if and how the advocacy efforts of NGOs are effective in decreasing sex trafficking. The qualitative analysis derives from interviews with sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah, Georgia.¹ The responses from these interviews are analyzed alongside data on the number of sex trafficking victims in Savannah, GA over the past five years.

The sex trafficking NGOs interviewed provide variation in the independent variables, because although the NGOs may have a common mission, their knowledge, capacity, and overall effectiveness vary. Thus, interviewing diverse sex trafficking NGOs allows me to pinpoint what factors lead to NGOs most effectively decreasing sex trafficking. There is also variation in the dependent variable through the data on the number of sex trafficking victims in Savannah covering a five year span, because the data recorded within each year is unique.

Focusing on sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah is ideal for this study, because Savannah is an urban city where acts of sex trafficking prevail and where NGOs actively work to combat sex trafficking. For example, Operation Dark Night was a sting operation that victimized dozens of women in Savannah by forcing them into sexual acts. Savannah is an ideal place for sex traffickers to transport and recruit women, because it is connected to I-95 and I-16. Also, Savannah is an accessible distance from which I can obtain data.

¹Research approved by Georgia Southern University’s Institutional Review Board under protocol #H19048.
By focusing on cases of sex trafficking in Savannah, I control for location. This ensures the equality of the prostitution rate, occurrence of natural disasters, poverty, labor laws, and the state’s regulation of human trafficking. It is important for scholars to consider these factors on a level playing field, because it ensures that conditions that may promote sex trafficking are equally accounted for and that NGOs are working within the same arena.

I also control for the type of NGO, as I only interview NGOs that focus on combating sex trafficking. Narrowing my focus to sex trafficking NGOs is important, because I exclusively seek to discover how powerful sex trafficking NGOs are in decreasing sex trafficking.

There may be some areas of concern regarding controls within my study. I do not control for the size of the NGOs interviewed, as designated by the number of employees. An organization’s size is one of the components that Seybolt (2009) identifies as characterizing the structure of NGOs. Thus, the size of a sex trafficking NGO not being controlled for may contribute to an increase or decrease in the effectiveness of an individual NGO’s efforts to decrease sex trafficking. For example, a larger NGO may have a greater capacity to combat sex trafficking as a result of their larger size.

The independent variable is the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs in decreasing sex trafficking. I use three indicators to measure the independent variable: NGOs combining their knowledge, NGOs combining their capacity, and NGOs coordinating the totality of their efforts to combat sex trafficking. Together, these indicators enable me to analyze what properties of NGOs cause NGOs to most effectively decrease sex trafficking. If NGOs combine their knowledge and capacity to combat sex
trafficking, I conclude that sex trafficking will decrease in the short-term. This follows interconnectedness between NGOs increasing the knowledge and resources they possess leading to a more effective fight against sex trafficking. If NGOs coordinate the totality of their efforts to combat sex trafficking, I conclude that sex trafficking will decrease in the long-term. Through coordination, NGOs will not only have more knowledge and resources to combat sex trafficking, but a network through which they possess the greatest effectiveness to combat sex trafficking.

To obtain qualitative data on these indicators, I interview sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah. In these interviews, I discover the extent in which NGOs combine their knowledge, combine their capacity, and coordinate their efforts. The interview questions I ask are listed in Appendix A. Questions 1-4 account for NGOs combining their knowledge by seeking to identify the role, structure, and strategies of NGOs individually and in relation to other NGOs. Questions 5-8 account for NGOs combining their capacity by addressing the financial resources of NGOs and the platform from which NGOs promote awareness of sex trafficking and assist victims of sex trafficking in the community. Questions 9 and 10 account for sex trafficking NGOs coordinating their efforts, by inquiring whether NGOs coordinate their efforts and how this affects their assistance. Through posing these questions, sex trafficking NGOs provided answers that address each indicator of the independent variable. Interviewing sex trafficking NGOs is a valid method, because through interviews I obtain the latest, first-hand information from NGOs in Savannah.

The dependent variable is the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs. I measure the dependent variable by analyzing data on the number of sex trafficking victims in the
state of Georgia. After contact with the Federal Bureau of Investigation (F.B.I.) in Savannah, there is not data that encompass the number of sex trafficking victims exclusive to Savannah. While data specific to Savannah would be ideal, I use data on the number of sex trafficking victims in Georgia, which is still somewhat specific to the area of focus. Data on Georgia also most likely reflects the trends of sex trafficking cases in Savannah, as sex trafficking cases in Savannah are included in these data sets.

I retrieved statistics on the number of sex trafficking victims in Georgia from the Polaris Project. The Polaris Project is a national NGO that works to combat sex trafficking through the National Human Trafficking Hotline. Following cases the Polaris Project works on, data is recorded on an online, public platform. Retrieving data from the Polaris Project is reliable, because this is an authoritative source that is considered credible among the public. As a national NGO that partners with numerous sex trafficking organizations, the Polaris Project is a reliable and unbiased source. Therefore, the data I analyze is from a reliable source that relates to my research question and is relevant to the location of the NGOs I interview.

I analyze data from 2012 and 2017, which corresponds to how I define the short-term as five years ago. After contact with the F.B.I. in Savannah and other organizations with data on the number of sex trafficking victims, there is no data recorded from ten years ago. Although the absence of data from ten years ago does not align with my definition of the long-term, the data available from the past five years aligns with my definition of the short-term. Data that addresses the short-term is suitable to analyze for the purposes of this study, because it is the next best alternative to data that covers the long-term and still reveals trends on cases of sex trafficking in Georgia.
Based on the data, I evaluate whether the number of sex trafficking victims has increased or decreased in the short-term. The difference between the number of sex trafficking victims in the short-term serves as a comparison for the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs combining their knowledge and capacity, along with coordinating their efforts. If the number of sex trafficking victims increases in the short-term, my argument reasons that NGOs are not combining their knowledge, capacity, and totality of their efforts to increase their effectiveness in decreasing sex trafficking. If the number of sex trafficking victims decreases in the short-term, my argument reasons that NGOs are combining their knowledge, capacity, and totality of their efforts to increase their effectiveness in decreasing sex trafficking.

This comparison is not completely robust, as endogenous factors may contribute to an increase or decrease in sex trafficking. Still, this comparison is a sound indicator for recognizing how coordination between sex trafficking NGOs impacts their effectiveness, because there is no quantitative data on coordination between sex trafficking NGOs. Further, endogenous factors may affect the data on the number of sex trafficking victims. If more public awareness or the efforts of NGOs contribute to an increase in the number of reported sex trafficking cases, the number of sex trafficking victims may naturally increase from 2012 to 2017.

I hope that qualitative data from this study will lay a foundation for future research that evaluates the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs when coordinating their efforts. In all, this research design sufficiently tests my hypotheses. Interviewing sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah controls for location and obtains the most recent information. Data on the number of sex trafficking victims in Georgia in the short-term
aligns with the trends of sex trafficking cases in Savannah, while also revealing whether NGOs are coordinating their efforts with one another. Through interviews and the available data, I am able to discover to what extent and how NGOs combining their knowledge, combining their capacity, and coordinating their efforts impacts the prevalence of sex trafficking acts.

Analysis

As NGOs combat sex trafficking in Savannah, it is imperative to know their effectiveness, because if NGOs are not effective acts of sex trafficking will continue to prevail. I evaluate the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs through analyzing the extent of these NGOs combining their knowledge, combining their capacity, and coordinating their efforts. Through interviewing six sex trafficking NGOs, I find whether or not coordination exists between sex trafficking NGOs and how coordination correlates with their effectiveness. The interview responses embedded within this analysis are consistently labeled A to F, with each number corresponding to one sex trafficking NGO. The labels A to F are grouped in accordance to each independent variable.

By analyzing data on the number of sex trafficking victims in Georgia in the short-term I evaluate a trend that suggests whether or not sex trafficking NGOs are coordinating their efforts to most effectively decrease sex trafficking. The data is provided to strengthen or weaken the support interview responses provide or fail to provide for each independent variable. Between interviews and data analysis, I find that there is moderate coordination between sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah. Still, there are
opportunities for coordination between NGOs to expand to most effectively combat sex trafficking.

Data

Through contact with the F.B.I. in Savannah and Interviewee F (2019) confirming there is no data specific to the number of sex trafficking victims in Savannah, there is no data for the long-term. However, data is available from 2012 to 2017, which fits how I define the short-term. The number of sex trafficking victims in Georgia rose from 77 sex trafficking victims in 2012 to 193 sex trafficking victims in 2017 (National Human Trafficking Hotline 2018). The data is summarized in Table 1. There was an increase in the number of sex trafficking victims in Georgia from 2012 to 2017. Although there was a 2.5% increase in the number of sex trafficking victims from 2012 to 2017, the data does not reflect a lack of coordination among NGOs in Savannah (National Human Trafficking Hotline 2017). There are endogenous factors not accounted for that may affect the data, including more public awareness on sex trafficking that naturally contributes to an increase in the number of sex trafficking cases that are reported.

Following the data, there is not strong support or sufficient evidence that the efforts of sex trafficking NGOs, whether coordinated or otherwise, contribute to a decrease in sex trafficking. Preliminarily, the data rejects my hypotheses. Still, there is more to the story based on Interviewees sharing that NGOs coordinate their efforts and that coordination does make the fight against sex trafficking more effective (Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). Without endogenous factors and data that covers the effectiveness of NGOs
coordinating their efforts, I suspect the data would show a decrease in the number of sex trafficking victims following the coordination among NGOs.

**Knowledge**

My first hypothesis posits that NGOs combining their knowledge, defined by the structural components and strategies of an NGO, will lead to a decrease in sex trafficking in the short-term. In regards to the structural components of NGOs, the management of A and B are comprised of volunteers (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018). Therefore, A and B mentioned the difficulty of sustaining a consistent focus on their mission, as the management and others involved maintain other jobs and roles (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018). The management of C, E, and F operate within a flat structure, which Jonathan (1997) recognizes as the most optimal structure due to its provision of flexibility and teamwork among employee roles (Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018). NGO D did not discuss their managerial structure.

Although the flat structures Jonathan (1997) highlights are present in three of the six NGOs, none of the NGOs indicated that their managerial structure evolved from or that they share their managerial structure with other NGOs. Thus, there are no multilateral structures as Martin (1992) describes between NGOs. There is no foundation to evaluate whether multilateral structures are more effective in producing endurance among NGOs to most effectively decrease sex trafficking (Ruggie 1992; Seybolt 2009). Without NGOs sharing their optimal structures and in the absence of multilateral structures, there is no evidence to support my theory that NGOs sharing their structures
with one another will produce the most effective and lasting managerial structures to most effectively decrease sex trafficking.

While I found that NGOs do not share their managerial structures with one another, there is some evidence that NGOs share their strategies with one another. NGOs C, D, E, and F stated that NGOs do communicate with one another (Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). Interviewee C (2018), Interviewee E (2018), and Interviewee F (2019) emphasized the importance of the NGOs communicating to quickly fill the necessities of secure housing, basic material goods, and counseling services for victims.

Still, Interviewee A (2018) believed there needs to be more communication among organizations, because NGOs are not coherent in their efforts against sex trafficking. Interviewee B (2018) recognized that there is communication between NGOs but confirmed the desire for greater communication by stating: “organizations tend to operate as silos; they are not good at sharing information with one another.” Therefore, there is some evidence that suggests NGOs share their strategies, but there is also evidence that NGOs need to increase communication in regards to their strategies. There is some support of my theory following Martin’s (1992) and Ruggie’s (1992) logic that NGOs sharing their strategies will enable them to embrace the best strategies to most effectively decrease sex trafficking.

In all, there is some support for my first hypothesis due to some evidence that reveals NGOs combine their knowledge, but there is insufficient evidence following the data that NGOs combining their knowledge will decrease sex trafficking in the short-term. Although there is some communication between NGOs, there are no multilateral
structures between NGOs and not all NGOs perceive effective communication between NGOs. Still, it is significant that NGOs that do communicate with one another follow a protocol that increases the efficiency of victim services.

**Capacity**

My second hypothesis argues that NGOs combining their capacity, which includes their platform, interaction with the government and citizens, and monetary resources, will decrease sex trafficking in the short-term. NGOs D, E, and F do not focus on advocacy efforts, so NGOs combining their platform is not relevant to D, E, and F (Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019).

Organizations A, B, and C focus on advocacy efforts in the community. For example, Organization A raises awareness on sex trafficking through posting signage throughout Savannah and hosting local presentations to educate the public on sex trafficking (Interviewee A, 2018).

There is one annual event to advocate against sex trafficking in Savannah hosted by an NGO and attended by multiple organizations and individuals (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). Interviewee F (2019) claimed the annual event follows the rise of more efforts against sex trafficking in Savannah in the fifteen years since Interviewee F has worked with sex trafficking victims. However, no interviewees disclosed whether this advocacy event prompts public action against sex trafficking. Following this, there is not sufficient evidence for my argument that NGOs shedding light on sex trafficking injustices causes
citizens to act against sex trafficking due to a negative perception of sex trafficking (Davis et al. 2012).

As NGOs A, B, and C focus on advocacy and there being one annual event where numerous the community of Savannah comes together to raise awareness of sex trafficking without gauge on the impact of the event, there is limited support that NGOs combining their platform to raise awareness of sex trafficking further decreases sex trafficking. Further, there is no boomerang pattern at work to increase public awareness of sex trafficking to most effectively decrease sex trafficking (Keck and Sikkink 1999). There is no spiral model between NGOs in Savannah, which leads to insufficient support for my argument that greater public knowledge of sex trafficking victims and the public pressuring the government for justice will inspire citizens to engage in the efforts of sex trafficking NGOs (Risse 2007).

All NGOs mentioned that they maintain some level of interaction with the government (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). No NGOs shared that they individually or collectively shame the government. Rather, NGOs maintain contact with the government to inform the government of sex trafficking cases or to provide assistance to sex trafficking cases that the government identifies (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). With NGOs not partaking in state shaming, there is no support for my argument that pressure on state governments from above and from below will lead to more citizens assisting NGOs in raising awareness when there is a lack of government action (Kaloudis 2017; Murdie and Davis 2012).
NGOs did not suggest that there are victims of noncompliance in Savannah, because there was no mention of the government incompetently addressing or neglecting sex trafficking cases in Savannah. Therefore, there is no evidence for my argument that more citizens will take action against sex trafficking in light of an incompetent or apathetic government (Dai 2005).

Interviewee C (2018) provided support for my argument that public knowledge of injustices and a greater trust in NGOs will cause more citizens to act against sex trafficking, which will further decrease sex trafficking (Dai 2005). Interviewee C (2018) emphasized how public knowledge of sex trafficking through the media and celebrities that take a stand against sex trafficking leads to increased public interest and action in diminishing sex trafficking. Although Interviewee C (2018) witnessed how media on the national level leads to an increase in public interest towards decreasing sex trafficking, no NGOs in Savannah highlighted personal engagement with the media to attract the public’s interest in combating sex trafficking. Thus, there is no CNN effect in Savannah that is stirring public grievances regarding sex trafficking and causing the public to demand action from leaders against sex trafficking resulting from NGOs engaging with the media.

Interviewee A (2018), Interviewee B (2018), and Interviewee C (2018) disclosed that while citizens may become passionate about combating sex trafficking, it is hard to retain the passion of citizens over time. Interviewee C (2018) attributed the difficulty of maintaining the passion and volunteerism of citizens to the preference citizens have for tangible instead of intangible volunteer work. Unfortunately, citizens cannot often participate in tangible work, which involves direct contact with victims, to preserve the
security of victims (Interviewee C, 2018). Therefore, there is some support for my argument that public knowledge of injustices will cause more citizens to act against sex trafficking to further decrease sex trafficking. Although inconsistent volunteerism will not lead to a consistently greater force combating sex trafficking to most effectively decrease sex trafficking, there is power in an annual advocacy event and public interest when it is strong (Dai 2005; Interviewee C, 2018).

Lastly, NGOs D and E did not include information on their financial resources. Interviewee A (2018) and Interviewee B (2018) shared that they do not combine monetary resources with other NGOs. Interviewee C (2018) also shared no combination of monetary resources with other NGOs, but that fundraisers held by NGOs are attended by other NGOs and government personnel. Interviewee F (2019) disclosed no combination of monetary resources in their individual functions, but that through grants and pooling money together sex trafficking NGOs formed an informal task force that works against sex trafficking.

With presence at the annual event against sex trafficking, the establishment of and accountability for following a protocol when victims are identified, and seeking to match the needs of sex trafficking victims through one financial fund, financial coordination seems to effectively support the efforts of the Task Force (Interviewee F, 2019). Further, without multilateral structures among NGOs, no apparatus is in place for NGOs to combine their monetary resources.

Through the financial combination of the Task Force, there is some support for my argument that NGOs combining their monetary resources leads to lower economic costs for individual NGOs and furthers the impact of the monetary resources of NGOs by
pooling more monetary resources together (Martin 1992). There is power in members involved in the Task Force combining given and raised funds to further decrease sex trafficking (Interviewee F, 2019). Still, there were no actions produced from the Task Force attributed to a decrease in sex trafficking in Savannah. Through the financial combination of the Task Force, there is some support for my argument that NGOs combining their monetary resources leads to lower economic costs for individual NGOs and furthers the impact of the monetary resources of NGOs by pooling more monetary resources together (Martin 1992).

NGOs A and B depend on fundraisers to sustain their efforts (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018). NGOs C and F depend on fundraisers to support their efforts, but also receive grants from governmental and non-governmental organizations (Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee E, 2019). With only C and F receiving but not combining institutional financial support, there is no evidence for my argument that NGOs combining institutional financial support further decreases sex trafficking by accounting for overlaps in NGO spending and thus furthering the monetary resources of NGOs. However, the Task Force combining institutional financial support they receive and pooling together monetary resources supports my argument that NGOs combining institutional financial support further decreases sex trafficking, because the Task Force combining financial resources accounts for overlaps in spending and furthers the capacity of their efforts (Interviewee F, 2019).

Overall, there is some support for my hypothesis that NGOs combining their capacity leads to a decrease in sex trafficking in the short-term. NGOs do not consistently combine their platforms, interactions with the government and citizens, and monetary
resources. Still, there is some support that NGOs combining their platform to raise awareness of sex trafficking most effectively decreases sex trafficking, because NGOs host an annual event to combat sex trafficking and further their fight against sex trafficking through their Task Force. There is limited support that NGOs combining their interactions with the government and citizens or monetary resources most effectively decreases sex trafficking, because NGOs only combine their monetary resources through the Task Force. While there is evidence that citizens may step in to combat sex trafficking alongside NGOs, citizens are not consistent in their volunteerism and there is limited evidence that NGOs prompt citizen action from their advocacy efforts or engagement with the media.

**Coordination**

My third hypothesis argues that NGOs coordinating the totality of their efforts through intentional connection rather than connecting when convenient will decrease sex trafficking in the long-term. My central theory is that NGOs coordinating their efforts most effectively decreases sex trafficking, because coordination prompts a network of sex trafficking NGOs characterized by longevity, transparency, and the optimization of their services for victims.

acknowledged some communication between NGOs, but called for intentional coordination.

Following Interviewee B (2018) claiming that NGOs cannot function without working alongside other NGOs, Interviewee E (2018) and Interviewee F (2019) highlighted how coordinating with other NGOs ensures there is a uniform protocol to follow when victims are located, which includes providing housing and counseling resources for victims in a timely manner. Interviewee C (2018) also shared the need for a uniform protocol to ensure NGOs react to sex trafficking cases in the most effective manner possible.

Following this, Interviewee C (2018) recognized that NGOs must be dependent on one another to follow the protocol they commit to. To be dependent on one another NGOs must trust one another to some extent, because without trust there is no foundation from which NGOs would willingly follow a uniform protocol. Therefore, due to NGOs coordinating their efforts and following a uniform protocol to combat sex trafficking, there is some evidence for my argument that NGOs coordinating their efforts will increase trust among NGOs (Wennerholm 2002).

Although Interviewee C (2018), Interviewee E (2018), and Interviewee F (2019) capitalized on how NGOs coordinate to follow a uniform protocol, there was no mention that victim services have improved due to coordination. Yet, Interviewee F (2019) suggested victim assistance is more effective through coordination, because victims receive uniform service provision in a timely manner. Thus, there is limited support for my argument that NGOs working together improves victim services.
There is not sufficient evidence or data to support my argument that NGOs coordinating their efforts will produce longer endurance of NGOs. Interviewee B (2018) mentioned the demise of one sex trafficking NGO and Interviewee D (2018) is a new NGO that was prompted by the need for more housing for victims. With mention of NGOs on the decline and NGOs on the rise, along with no data accounting for the consistency of the efforts of NGOs in Savannah over time, there is no foundation to support my argument that NGOs coordinating their efforts leads to NGOs enduring longer (Ohanyan 2009).

However, NGO D was established in response to the need for more victim housing (Interviewee D, 2018). Other sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah recognize the need for housing for victims and formed strategies to increase housing for victims through the Task Force (Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). Yet, with inconsistent funding and NGO D expanding the amount of available housing for victims, the Task Force paused their efforts (Interviewee C, 2018). Victim housing remains the greatest need identified by the NGOs (Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). There is limited support for my argument that NGOs working together increases the number of victim services. While NGO D formed to provide more victim housing and operates by NGOs coordinating to follow protocol, more victim housing among other needs are still present (Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019).

While Interviewee A (2018) stated that there is not sufficient coordination among NGOs, NGOs B, C, D, E, and F shared there is coordination among NGOs (Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F,
2019). Therefore, there is evidence that NGOs coordinate some of their efforts, despite data on the number of sex trafficking victims revealing an increase in the number of sex trafficking victims in the short-term in Georgia.

There is insufficient evidence that NGOs coordinating their efforts decreases sex trafficking in the long-term, because there is no data that covers the long-term, which I define as ten years ago. There is some evidence for my argument that NGOs that fail to coordinate their efforts will be hindered from reaching their full potential, because the majority of NGOs shared that the coordination of their efforts helps them fulfill their full potential (Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018). Further, Interviewee A (2018) stated NGOs would further their potential if there was more coordination between their efforts. Still, Interviewee A (2018), Interviewee B (2018), and Interviewee F (2019) recognized that there is room for improvement in regards to NGO coordination to reach their potential in fighting against sex trafficking. This suggests that NGOs do not fulfill their potential without coordination due to there being opportunity for coordination to strengthen the efforts of NGOs.

Overall, my theory that NGOs intentionally coordinating the totality of their efforts decreases sex trafficking in the long-term is semi-supported. In the short-term in which data is available, there is some evidence to support my theory. The data increases from 77 sex trafficking victims in 2012 to 193 sex trafficking victims in 2017, which does not support that NGOs coordinating their efforts decreases sex trafficking. However, Interviewees sharing that NGOs coordinate their efforts and calling for the continuation of and more coordination suggests that coordination improves the efforts of NGOs to decrease sex trafficking (Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018;
Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). If there were data for the effectiveness of NGOs coordinating their efforts, I predict that it would reveal a decrease in sex trafficking following NGOs coordinating their efforts.

Although my three hypotheses cannot be supported based on insufficient data, Interviewees provided some support for my hypotheses. There seems to be a necessity for and power within NGOs coordinating their efforts following qualitative responses (Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019). I am not convinced that NGOs coordinating their efforts negatively impacts their effectiveness and would like to seek data to strongly support the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGO coordination in the future (Interviewee A, 2018; Interviewee B, 2018; Interviewee C, 2018; Interviewee D, 2018; Interviewee E, 2018; Interviewee F, 2019).

Conclusion

Sex trafficking is a daunting reality for millions worldwide. It is necessary to evaluate the effectiveness of NGOs combating sex trafficking, because without effective results from the work of NGOs sex trafficking will continue to occur and may increase. First, I posit that NGOs combining their knowledge will decrease sex trafficking. Further, I argue that NGOs combining their capacity decreases sex trafficking. Lastly, I argue that NGOs intentionally coordinating the totality of their efforts decreases sex trafficking.

Through interviewing sex trafficking NGOs in Savannah, I find some evidence that NGOs combine their knowledge and capacity, as NGOs maintain a great presence at an annual anti-sex trafficking event and sometimes exchange information with one
another. I find some evidence that NGOs intentionally coordinate the totality of their efforts with one another, as NGOs deemed coordination necessary to follow a uniform protocol to efficiently provide resources for victims. Despite insufficient data to support my hypotheses, I still argue that coordination makes possible and furthers the effectiveness of NGOs following qualitative responses. To test whether coordination between NGOs is effective to decrease sex trafficking in the future, more specific data on the number of sex trafficking victims and additional controls against endogenous factors are needed.

Aside from whether NGOs are effective in decreasing sex trafficking, NGOs are interested in opportunities for coordination beyond the annual event that currently exists, such as students hosting lectures to raise awareness of sex trafficking at a University (Interviewee A, 2018). The fact that sex trafficking NGOs are interested in more opportunities for coordination reveals the need for coordination. Still, it is necessary to continue evaluating based on the trends of data over time whether NGOs coordinating their efforts most effectively decreases sex trafficking.

Prior to conducting interviews, I did not consider volunteer consistency in the events and services of sex trafficking NGOs as a factor that affects the effectiveness of NGOs. After interviewing NGOs, the impact of volunteer consistency on the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs is a point for future consideration. Further, would the coordination of volunteers between organizations lead to a greater decrease in sex trafficking? Likewise, if sex trafficking NGOs came together to host fundraising events or coordinated fundraising events with one another to prevent overlap in dates, would more money be raised for their efforts?
Lastly, Interviewee A (2018) pointed to sex trafficking NGOs in Atlanta as a model for effective coordination, because NGOs in Atlanta coordinate their efforts more than NGOs in Savannah. Interviewee B (2018) mentioned a statewide task force that meets monthly in Atlanta to exchange information, which Savannah sends representatives to attend. Interviewee F (2019) viewed sex trafficking NGOs in Atlanta as more established and coordinated due to more resources. Following these observations, intentional coordination among sex trafficking NGOs in Atlanta seems to most effectively decrease sex trafficking in Atlanta. Given the time, proximity, and resources, it would be worthwhile to study the effectiveness of sex trafficking NGOs in Atlanta coordinating their efforts. Further, it is worth considering in future research whether sex trafficking NGOs between Savannah and Atlanta form a domestic network similar to a TAN to most effectively decrease sex trafficking in Georgia.
Appendix A

*Interview Questions*

1. What is your particular role in [insert given sex trafficking NGO]?

2. What is the mission of [insert given sex trafficking NGO]?

3. How does [insert given sex trafficking NGO] work to accomplish this mission?
   a. Do they use any specific strategies?

4. What is the managerial structure of [insert given sex trafficking NGO]?
   a. How did this managerial structure evolve?
      i. Was this influenced by another NGO’s structure?

5. How is [insert given sex trafficking NGO] financed?

6. Does or has [insert given sex trafficking NGO] combined their financial resources with any other NGOs? Or any government actors?
   a. If so, how has this impacted the efforts of [insert given sex trafficking NGO]?

7. How does [insert given sex trafficking NGO] obtain information related to sex trafficking?
   a. Including background information on the issue, how to address it, or who to help?
   b. Has information been exchanged between this NGO and other NGOs? Any government actors?

8. How does [insert given sex trafficking NGO] promote sex trafficking awareness in the community?
a. If applicable, how has the promoted awareness inspired people to take action against sex trafficking?

b. If applicable, how has the promoted awareness influenced the overall amount of reported sex trafficking cases?

9. Does [insert given sex trafficking NGO] have any partnerships with other NGOs?
   a. If so, in what capacity?
   b. If so, how does this partnership influence the efforts of [insert given sex trafficking NGO]?

10. How has [insert given sex trafficking NGO] been effective in combating and/or decreasing sex trafficking?

Appendix B

Table 1 Number of Sex Trafficking Victims in Savannah

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of Sex Trafficking Victims</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bibliography


