Using Quality/Time Graphs to Teach Freshman English Students How to Assess Journal Quality

Andrew Wohrley
Auburn University, AL

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.georgiasouthern.edu/gaintlit

Part of the Curriculum and Instruction Commons, and the Information Literacy Commons

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.georgiasouthern.edu/gaintlit/2012/2012/1

This presentation (open access) is brought to you for free and open access by the Conferences & Events at Digital Commons@Georgia Southern. It has been accepted for inclusion in Georgia International Conference on Information Literacy by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons@Georgia Southern. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@georgiasouthern.edu.
Using Quality/Time Graphs to Teach Freshman English Students How to Assess Journal Quality

Andrew Wohrley
Auburn University Libraries
wohrlaj@auburn.edu
Outline

• The Problem:
  – Teaching students how to assess journal quality

• Traditional Methods
  – Lecture
  – Pass around journals
  – Tear apart the article
  – iClicker and discuss

• Their benefits
  – Lecture is simple
  – Pass around gives concrete examples
  – iClicker promotes feedback
  – Tearing apart the parts of an article is fun
Cont’d

• Their Problems:
  – Lecture is boring
  – Passing around journals can be ambiguous
  – iClicker demonstrates who doesn’t get the instruction, but not why
  – Tearing apart articles requires a supply of surplus journals
The Solution

• Graph student understanding of journal quality!
The Q-T chart

• An adaptation of the traditional popular, trade, scholarly distinction
• Is graphic
• Encourages group work
• Sets a baseline that all students can see for their understanding of journal article quality
• Allows students to demonstrate understanding of article quality
Explaining popular-trade-scholarly

• Popular
  – Illustrated
  – advertisements

• Trade
  – Focus on one industry
  – advertisements

• Scholarly
  – Written by scientists
  – Citations
However...

Journal Continuum

Popular         Trade         Scholarly
People          Aviation Week Science
Elements of Quality

• Accuracy
• Authority
• Sources cited
• Timeliness
• Neutrality/Bias
How it is done

• Divide class into teams of 3-5 members
• Give teams 2 minutes to answer a question
  – This question is deliberately broad
  – Aimed at getting the students to reveal what sources that they usually use in research
  – Encouraged to question each other’s choices for articles to find the best one
How it is done, cont’d

• The groups then print out the first page of the item they found and tape it on a Quality/Time graph, with Q on the y axis and T on the x axis.

• The graph can be on any whiteboard.

• The students make relative judgments of each article’s quality, and absolute judgments of the date.
How it is done, cont’d

• The instructor then reviews the groups choices and adjusts the positions of the pages to make them more accurate

• The instructor explains any changes

• This constitutes the first instruction on assessing journal article quality.

• The class then continues on with database instruction
Conclusion of class

• After database instruction
  – Students reform groups
  – Answer the question they were given at beginning of class
  – Incorporate what they have learned
  – Cannot use the articles that they used the first time
Results

• There has been a distinct improvement in sources selected
• Even better, the students seem to grasp better, why they should want better sources
• Students more willing to use older sources
Future

- Add Quantitative measures
- Teach my colleagues this method
- Maybe go online
Example graph

Typical scatter of article results for 2\textsuperscript{nd} exercise.

Typical scatter of article results for 1\textsuperscript{st} exercise

Quality

last decade  last year  last month  last week  Present

Time
Conclusions

• The Q-T graph
  – Gives instructors a baseline for their students understanding of journal article quality
  – Gives students an active learning exercise
  – Provides an assessment at the end of class of how well they understand journal article quality
  – Still being refined
Results of exercise 1

White sheets 1\textsuperscript{st} exercise

Green sheets 2\textsuperscript{nd} exercise
Results of Exercise II
White sheets 1\textsuperscript{st} exercise
Green sheets 2\textsuperscript{nd} exercise